

Hong Kong Arts Development Council

International Arts Leadership Roundtable 2017 “Where Do the Arts Lead Us?”

Conference Summary

The Hong Kong Arts Development Council (HKADC) held the 3rd International Arts Leadership Roundtable from 29 to 30 November 2017 at Chiang Chen Studio Theatre, the Hong Kong Polytechnic University.

With this year’s theme ‘Where Do the Arts Lead Us?’, the Roundtable gathered around 20 leaders of various arts councils and institutions from Australia, Canada, Hong Kong, New Zealand, Singapore, the U.K. and U.S.A. to discuss the key trends and issues of arts development, and the formulation of relevant strategies to meet new challenges.

The Roundtable was inaugurated in 2013 and set as a biennial event. After the successful run of last year, it was invited by the Home Affairs Bureau to be held again this year and was held concurrently with the Asia Cultural Cooperation Forum 2017 organised by the Government of the HKSAR, to foster regional cooperation and development in arts and culture.

29 Nov 2017 - Day One**Plenary 1****Connecting the Arts with Audiences**

For the arts to make an impact, arts funders and artists strive to make it more accessible. While diverse channels are used to meet the needs of the locals and develop overseas audiences, the recent trend in creating interactive artworks also boosts participation in the arts. In this regard, how could we effectively collaborate to forge stronger connections between the arts and the audiences?

(1) Panel presentation by

Dr. Sorcha CAREY, Chair, Festivals Edinburgh [United Kingdom]

Edinburgh's Festivals: A Collaborative Story

- 1.1 Although Edinburgh is small, its historic capital being one of the renowned festivals centre in the world, and the world-renowned Edinburgh festivals each year attract about 4.5 million attendances. Surveys indicated that two-thirds of households engaged and 80% of those surveyed agree that the festivals make the city a better place to live. However, there are still people who think the festivals are not for them, and the question of the relevance of the festivals to the more disadvantaged citizens and to artists is of growing importance in civic and national debates.
- 1.2 Edinburgh's festival culture, with 70 years of history, was reviewed by Dr. Carey who traced back its origin to the birth of its first three important festivals in 1947, namely the Edinburgh International Festival, the Edinburgh Fringe and Edinburgh International Film Festival.
- 1.3 The unique festival eco-system of Edinburgh lays the foundation for collaborative ways of working across the city, and the 11 major festivals nowadays collectively bring a unique scale of diversified spectrum, which is a critical factor for connecting the local, national and international, as well as for engaging with local audiences. Especially in August, there are five festivals happening in the city at the same time, and the population of the city doubled during the month.
- 1.4 Festivals Edinburgh was established in 2006 under a wide recognition of this collaborative cluster approach. It is the collective development body for Edinburgh's major festivals to foster collaboration in agreed areas of shared priority. However, all the 11 festivals are fully independent in operation. Instead, Festivals Edinburgh acts as an umbrella body and, through extensive collaboration with different parties, formed a stakeholder board, the Festivals Forum, to work together to produce a new shared ten-year vision and to become a significant voice to the government.
- 1.5 Joining forces did make a greater impact and Dr. Carey shared some of her own examples:
 - i) The impact that the festivals [could achieve/achieved] as a collective makes them far more relevant to the different agendas of each of those main stakeholders
 - ii) It allows them to engage in conversations
 - iii) Other organisations are more willing to strategically invest in the cluster as a key local and national asset
- 1.6 Being a key facilitator and leader in the debate of how to improve access to culture, together with a mapping exercise, Festivals Edinburgh successfully engaged more than 500 independent artists across the city, 100 local arts organisations through networking, advice and mentoring, as well as

direct profiling. Festivals Edinburgh also initiated new projects as an attempt to connect diverse communities from across the city.

(2) Panel presentation by

Mr. Leong CHEUNG, Executive Director, Charities and Community, The Hong Kong Jockey Club

- 2.1 Mr. Cheung had an overview on the unique business model of the Hong Kong Jockey Club (the Jockey Club), established in 1884, and its charity works through the Charities Trust. It came a long way to its regular giving to the community of around HK\$ 7.6 billion in 2016. With a review of the long history of the Jockey Club's charity works including building community swimming pools, clinics, the Ocean Park and so on, Mr. Cheung placed his emphasis on supporting the arts and heritage such as contribution to the Hong Kong Academy for Performing Arts, the revitalisation of the Tai Kwun – Centre for Heritage and Arts (The Jockey Club CPS Limited) as well as the contribution to the establishment of the Hong Kong Palace Museum.
- 2.2 [Arts, culture and heritage are/“Arts, culture and heritage”] is one of the very key strategic initiatives, for which the keynotes lie on capacity building and infrastructure, talents, programmes, as well as audience building and public education reinforcement. In respect of audience building, improved accessibility to the arts and using arts as a tool to tackle social issues are two main areas that the Jockey Club will focus on in the next few years, particularly bringing arts to the disadvantaged groups and heritage revitalisation for the general public.
- 2.3 For capacity building and infrastructure, the Charities Trust funded many music and dance activities since the 1980s, particularly the Hong Kong Arts Festival for the last 46 years and a couple of major programmes, such as the “Jockey Club New Arts Power” with the Hong Kong Arts Development Council (HKADC). Also through different programmes, efforts were put on audience building and accessibility, with large part of funding in education and bringing underprivileged groups to the venues for inspiration of arts, and to build esteem and self-confidence of underprivileged children.

(3) Panel presentation by

Mrs. Rosa Huey DANIEL, Deputy Secretary (Culture), Ministry of Culture, Community & Youth (MCCY); Chief Executive Officer, National Arts Council [Singapore]

“Transcending Boundaries – Arts for Everyone”

- 3.1 Mrs. Daniel shared Singapore's journey in promoting arts. Singapore is young with only about 50 years of history as an independent country, making it very busy with infrastructure over the last 20 years, including revamping and housing museums and galleries, with the New National Gallery as the latest monument.
- 3.2 The government also made great efforts in building artistic capabilities and establishing arts groups, companies and communities, and decided to harness resources beyond government funding support. Cultural Matching Fund is an inspiring policy to activate contribution of private sector for which Mrs. Daniel estimated half of the dollar-for-dollar matching target of S\$350 million (HKD 1.5 billion) has been drawn down. Together with a tax deduction scheme, the policy really gave a boost to NAC's works. However, Mrs. Daniel expressed that they need to learn more about crowd funding and to make the Singaporean audiences understand that every dollar counts.

- 3.3 The role of the arts is going to be increasingly important nowadays, and a core vision of National Arts Council (NAC) is to connect people of all age through arts, not only nurturing creative excellence but also engaging audiences through deeper engagement and participation to engender a deep sense of Singapore's unique multicultural identity. The arts also helps to position Singapore globally by bringing its arts abroad.
- 3.4 There was a nationwide population survey in 2015 indicating that engagement of arts events reached a considerably high point in a decade. However, tapping into new audiences was always challenging, and that is what NAC is studying and working on, dedicated to make the arts an integral part of life in Singapore.
- 3.5 Arts groups play an important role to engage new audience. For example, Mrs. Daniel showed how Drama Box, the leading Singapore theatre group, created a pop-up theatre space in neighbourhoods as a means to connect communities. Besides, community spaces are also very important to activate and reach out to those communities. Mrs. Daniel shared an example of how they work with libraries, schools, communities, different centres and even many housing estates to connect people on a large scale together with their existing 15 community arts and culture nodes.
- 3.6 How to reach the young is one of NAC's key strategies and Mrs. Daniel shared their works to bring the arts to younger generations. For example:
- i) Systematically programmed arts into the school syllabus and offered students structured visits to museums.
 - ii) 4,000 to 5,000 children were introduced to the Singapore National Youth Orchestra with electronic music coming together to enter the space of Esplanade, the national theatre of Singapore, to lower children's psychological barrier of visiting theatre, and to hopefully build future audiences.
 - iii) The platform called "Noise Singapore" was in place which has become a big movement for the young to create opportunities and reach out to other young people. /In 2016, this festival has attracted 41,000 to participate, many of whom were young people.
- 3.7 Mrs. Daniel also shared their works for other disadvantaged groups like the active "Silver Arts" programme for the elderly population, and other programmes for people who are underprivileged. Digital engagement is another area they are working hard to bring arts to online audiences in different ways, especially to the young demographics.

**(4) Panel presentation by
Mr. Rupert MYER, Chair, Australia Council for the Arts**

"A Culturally Ambitious Nation"

- 4.1 By sharing his recent speech given to different stakeholders to support the case for a new gallery in Hamilton, Mr. Myer pointed out that the arts produce not only economic benefits for the community, but also create community confidence, provide cultural definition particularly to diverse communities and enhance well-being, whilst being enlightening, energising and an inexhaustible source of pleasure.
- 4.2 The result of the National Arts Participation Survey indicates a changing attitude of Australians towards the arts -- a high level of participation with 98% surveyed engaged in the arts in some manner, showing that arts and culture are valuable to them. For those surveyed, 79% read books,

72% attend live events, 46% creatively participate themselves, 35% attended the First Nations Arts in 2016, doubling that of 2009.

- 4.3 The National Gallery Victoria in Melbourne is now the 16th most visited art gallery in the world, while annual attendances at the Museum of the Old and New Art exceeded 400,000 with almost 75% being inbound tourists. Mr. Myer cited the additional example of Hobart which arts and culture has turned it into a popular travel destination. The Dark MOFO Festival during the coolest time of the year in the coldest part of the country brought nearly 9 million visitors from the nation and the world, boosting the local economy in various ways, leaving a useful lesson for policymakers.
- 4.4 Whilst the economic aspect is compelling, it is also vital to acknowledge that some things are unmeasurable such as tolerance, respect, empathy and community cohesion. Arts and engagement in the arts provide one of the best tools for cultural diversity with interest and learning rather than difference, opposition, and conflict. Based on the recent research of the University of Western Australia, engagement in the arts is as healthy as having exercise for 30 minutes a day. Besides, Australians believe the arts could promote social cohesion and build community confidence – the willingness to take risks and invest in different ways.
- 4.5 Mr. Myer answered on how to advocate greater commitment and philanthropic support from different parties for cultural projects, and pointed out that even when people seem unattached to arts and culture, art still does matter without them acknowledging it. Cultural relevance, enjoyment and fun should be at the heart of what we do. The scoping should be a fact-based body of work and it should inspire and draw a community together and along. The entrepreneurial vision should take hold, and everyone should no longer just be custodians of a collection, but cultural entrepreneurs.

**(5) Panel presentation by
Ms. Lynn F. C. YAU, Chief Executive Officer, The Absolutely Fabulous Theatre
Connection [Hong Kong]**

“In the Flow: A View of the Arts in Education”

- 5.1 With an introduction that the arts are for everybody, Ms. Yau offered another side to the equation of arts engagement by upscaling audience to the arts through arts education and arts in education, equipping the young to be creative and critical thinkers.
- 5.2 Ms. Yau explained why emphasis was placed on arts education with three reasons:
- i) Let the audience be mindfully present, not just physically present.
 - ii) A higher level of participation, appreciation and enjoyment of the arts.
 - iii) Audienceship means letting the audience make better-informed, valuable and sophisticated demand on the works of arts.
- 5.3 For AFTEC, three strategic areas lie on learning and participation, youth empowerment and, in particular, arts for change. The education system moulds a fixed mindset which is not adaptable to all the challenges and the changes nowadays. That is why arts and creativity are so important.
- 5.4 Arts are for all, with which Ms. Yau shared her first-hand experience in arts education over the years like teaching medical students at the University of Hong Kong drama, music and dance, and working with social workers to bring arts to a more diverse audience, as well as to take young theatre makers to critique excerpts, not simply to act them out. Immersive theatre is held for children, and relaxed theatre for people with autisms or learning difficulties. There is also an

extensive engagement of teenagers and schools under an ambition to let the participants know that the arts are simply much more than just learning how to dance.

- 5.5 Under the AFTEC tangram approach, young people are offered the tools to understand, interpret and engage with the arts. Ms. Yau shared some remarks from their younger participants that the arts could really change lives. The outcomes of tangram are inspiring, with depth and understanding of the works making the arts a genuine connection with the audience.
- 5.6 Ms. Yau raised the necessity of an integrative cultural policy to bring funders, artists, arts organisations, teachers, schools and the government to work together. From what she witnessed and other examples, she pointed out that arts do change lives, and that it takes time to witness the change. Especially in a fast-paced city we live in, we must stop and pay attention to the values of art. Arts education is the foundation to let the young leap ahead and make great changes for us.

Plenary 2

Applying Technology in the Arts

The rapid evolution of digital technology in the 21st century heightens its importance to arts creation and development. Many arts funders and organisations have emphasised in their strategic plans the importance of applying digital technologies in their arts development and promotion endeavours. This discussion aims to identify the strategies and projects implemented around the world in enhancing the application of technology in the arts.

(6) Panel presentation by Mr. Simon BRAULT, Director & CEO, Canada Council for the Arts

“Funding the Arts in the Digital Age: A Canadian Approach”

- 6.1 To the Canada Council for the Arts (the Canada Council), the question of connecting Canada, a vast country but very small population, with the rest of the world is a question of sustainability at every level including the arts. Under support from the government with doubling the Council’s budget over 5 years, Canada is committed to again playing a bigger role on the international stage.
- 6.2 In Canada, there are artists who are at the forefront in digital creation. However, when the Canada Council did a large study to find out where the average theatre, dance, ballet, orchestra in the country are in terms of their capacity to cope with and to use digital technology to scale up their work, they found that the bulk of the arts sector was seriously lagging behind. The Canada Council realised that if they do not do anything to help the arts sector to transit to the digital era, the arts sector will remain with the same business model, the same habits and the same approaches that are pre-digital and that will hurt the Canadian art sector and marginalise them.
- 6.3 To help the sector to transit to the digital era, Canada Council created the Digital Strategy Fund. It is a transition fund of CAD88.5 million dollars over 5 years and with three main themes, which are the digital literacy, public engagement and new ways of working that are more adapted to digital. Having a belief that the future is built around collaboration and cooperation, the fund targets at projects that are presented not in a way to give specific edge as a company, but will benefit the sector or the subsector that one is part of.

6.4 Concluding his presentation, Mr. Brault raised a point that people may confuse the notion of being creative and the notion of being innovative. According to his explanation, innovation is new models, and that it is new ways of doing things. Innovation is needed to have the impact the arts should have in our society. Mr. Brault foresaw that our challenge for the near future is to make sure that art will be the proof that technology is not enough. He highlighted the need to redefine a kind of a humanistic approach that will fit the digital era to make sure that we will not lose control and that human beings will not be excluded from a model of civilization that is now emerging worldwide.

(7) Panel presentation by

Dr. Bryan Wai-ching CHUNG, Associate Professor, Academy of Visual Arts, Hong Kong Baptist University

“We Can Do Magic”

7.1 In his presentation, Dr. Chung introduced the concept of augmented reality with reference to several videos. He projected clips from different fictional films, one is the "The Prestige" by Christopher Nolan about two magicians who have their strong technical supporting team, including engineers and even scientists, in order to deliver their magic. Dr. Chung also projected a [TED talk video](#) by Marco Tempest, cyber illusionist, combining magic and technology to produce astonishing illusions.

7.2 Following the videos, Dr. Chung introduced Zach Lieberman, who co-founded a group named [openFrameworks](#), an open-source software community developed by artists and designers to help the community contribute back to the online social media, so that others could use the software for free in their creation. Other kinds of open-source software communities also provide huge support in foundation for artists and designers. According to Dr. Chung, the clips which had been shown, in modern term, as examples of augmented reality, which together with the technology of virtual reality receive a lot of sponsorships and other contributions from commercial sponsors or the communities nowadays.

7.3 Dr. Chung explained that the concept of augmented reality could in fact be dated back to magical tricks. Magic is more or less similar to augmented reality, which is the combination of both real presence and something projected on the screen as a way to deliver our performance or presentation.

(8) Panel presentation by

Mr. Andy STRATFORD, Managing Director, FutureEverything [United Kingdom]

Art to Inspire Technology – An Exploration of Value Creation

8.1 By introducing the background of FutureEverything as a cultural agency running the Digital Arts Festival in UK since 1995, Mr. Stratford brought following case studies of the organisation’s large-scale cultural and technology programmes in Europe and Asia to show how they are addressing the social impacts and consequences of a digital revolution.

- i. Smart Nation Singapore: FutureEverything delivered a digital culture component for the Singapore's 50th anniversary celebrations which included arts and culture in this flagship technology development programme.

- ii. CityVerve: which is the Internet of Things (IoT) in UK. FutureEverything supported the combination of art and IoT to stimulate innovation and raised awareness of key issues around big data, privacy, and accountability.

8.2 Mr. Stratford explained that trust is the currency in user-driven technology. Without trust, there is only one outcome and that is market failure. This is the central concern and the main barrier to market development in industries such as the Internet of Things (IoT) and that it is the biggest roadblock to citizen uptake of new technology. To Mr. Stratford, however, the arts could uniquely solve this problem by addressing transparency.

8.3 To further elaborate his arguments, Mr. Stratford introduced an artwork they developed as part of the UK's IoT Smart City Demonstrator CityVerve *Everything Every Time*, by Nahu Matsuda. The CityVerve artwork, which was conceived as the first implementation of an important technology innovation, the CityVerve API (application protocol interface), being a single access point to all data in the city. In the end, it turned out that the pace of artistic innovation moved faster than the pace of technology innovation. The artists were ready but the technology was not.

8.4 FutureEverything has recently shifted their focus to demonstrating the value and impact of artistic collaborations for non-arts partners, as well as developing tools and methods that others can adopt, which is called "STARTS" in Europe with collaborations to provide a scalable framework or process to which artists, technology organisations or facilitators can refer to.

8.5 The positive outcome of artistic practice and research is the open prototyping framework, which is a process model developed specifically for arts [[and]] science collaborations. This involves six phases:

- i. In the scoping phase, artistic research and critical thinking introduced novel framings of concepts, challenges or capabilities.
- ii. In the connect phase, open prototyping builds connections ownership and trust between partners and teams among citizens and service users.
- iii. During play, the unique skills of artists can explore limits of technologies, ideas, materials and applications.
- iv. In the producing of work, novel interfaces and open infrastructures can have imaginative dimensions to the Smart City.
- v. When work is displayed, art makes visible and legible systems that are hidden or complex and enables a wide audience to experience future scenarios.
- vi. Interpretation of the work can build transparency, judgment, agency and trust in the way people interact with data systems.

8.6 As a final note of his presentation, Mr. Stratford concluded that “arts to inspire technology” and “how we can think about arts and value creation” are two key contributions which support the idea that arts has a meaningful role in value creation in a technology innovation context.

– END OF DAY 1–

30 Nov 2017 - Day Two**Plenary 3****Exploring Boundaries of the Arts**

Cross-disciplinary collaboration in arts creation had become increasingly common. As the traditional demarcation of arts forms could no longer adequately meet the needs of our artists and audiences, how should we capably respond to this trend?

**(9) Panel presentation by
Mr. Patrick CHIU, Founder, Hong Kong SingFest**

Classical Choral Theatre

- 9.1 After a brief introduction of his role in the founding of Yat Po Singer and Hong Kong SingFest, Mr. Chiu shared a few video clips of some of his recent productions at Hong Kong SingFest, an art group which focuses on providing high-quality performances and innovative educational opportunities connecting local vocalists, instrumentalists, audiences and donors, with an aim of promoting human voice and the human body.
- 9.2 By sharing Hong Kong SingFest's productions, Mr. Chiu elaborated on one of the special features of the group: they perform with the use of acoustics and old instruments without any audio system to produce the classic effect. The group used such technique in their performance *Monteverdi Madrigals of War & Love* in 2017.
- 9.3 Mr. Chiu also shared his experience in collaborating with young people at Hong Kong SingFest. In last summer, Hong Kong SingFest put a group of high school students with an average age of around 15 in a theater setting and trained them for around 3 months. The group of young people lived together and created a familial bonding during a retreat. After the retreat, the group of young people was able to sing in Italian, a language they have never learnt before without a score. The successful outcome of the performance strengthened Mr. Chiu's belief in the importance of helping the next generation to work on something they passionately believe in.

**(10) Panel presentation by
Ms. Jane CHU, Chairman, National Endowment for the Arts [USA]**

Exploring the Creative Landscape

- 10.1 At the start of the presentation, Ms. Chu briefly depicted the National Endowment for the Art (NEA)'s investment in the arts over the past 5 decades resulting in more than 147,000 grants in total of USD 5 billion across 16,000 communities in the United States, covering literature translation, granting those who could not buy their own tickets, delivering related programmes in all kinds of arts, featuring top artists in jazz, folk and traditional arts, as well as granting arts projects for schools, concert halls, radio, television, digital and people with disabilities.
- 10.2 Today, through the programme "Creativity Connects" initiated by Ms. Chu, many people are benefited from the arts, and she presented a handful of successful cases across the United States:

- i. In Gainesville, Florida, musicians are hired to perform soothing music in a hospital and patients worked with artists to draw and paint. Relationship between medicine and art is proved to promote therapeutic quality.
- ii. In Fargo, North Dakota, artists are working with local government to create a public arts space.
- iii. In New Orleans, Louisiana, all 1,600 students of Lusher School from all grades participate in the arts in order to learn both arts skills and to engage in critical thinking. Outcomes of this arts-based education is compelling, not only in graduation rates and careers of the graduates, but also in contribution to the arts sector.
- iv. In Whitesburg, Kentucky, an arts organisation creates movies and videos, and run a community radio station and art gallery, as well as teaching the poor to make string instruments to bring in more than US 1.5 million dollars for the local economy.
- v. In 12 military installations across the United States, patients suffering from traumatic brain injury conditions receive services from art therapists of NEA and effective outcomes are reported.

10.3 NEA believes that the arts are valuable for everyone, and do not only belongs to certain groups. Hence, their team is committed to providing opportunities for individuals from child to grandparent to find their creative voices, as the arts instill citizen's lives with values, connection, creativity and innovation.

**(11) Panel presentation by
Dr. Richard GRANT, Former Chair, Creative New Zealand**

Developing Frameworks that Support Genuine Collaboration across Cultures and Disciplines

- 11.1 By quoting five occupations (app developer, social media manager, cloud computing specialist, YouTube content creator and Uber driver) that did not exist in 2006 according to Forbes magazines, Dr. Grant showed how rapidly things are changing today. As artists become more connected globally, their influences and experiences are shifting and transforming while, at the same time, technology not only defines the arts and creativity at the creative end of the process but also the receiving and consumer end. The fast-changing society places widespread implications for arts policy.
- 11.2 As population of New Zealand is getting more diverse in backgrounds, Creative New Zealand is committed to developing partnership with other regions having the same trends in the world. Dr. Grant pointed out that technology may not always help the ageing population and that factor has to be taken account in making policy.
- 11.3 For the sake of creating a strongly linked network in different countries for practitioners to cooperate effectively across regions and develop artistic works in common, the International Col-lab HK-NZ-UK, as a recent pilot programme, was co-launched by Creative New Zealand to push the boundary beyond and do something new, as well as promoting international cooperation. It is supported by funders and curators in New Zealand, Hong Kong and Scotland, forming a good example of cooperation between artists, curators and funding agencies. Dr. Grant shared his lessons learned from such collaborative programme:
 - i. It could not be done in a short frame of time.
 - ii. It has to be led by artists as they should decide what they want to do.
 - iii. Multidisciplinary is important but not essential.

- iv. As a funder it is important to keep open-minded, consult with all funders and developers so that everyone can share the same objectives. Also, in order to incorporate more people from different disciplines, Dr. Grant suggested that one may have to tweak the programme as it goes forward so that there will be different collaborative experiences.

Closing Discussion

The closing discussion was held with four local arts leaders invited to the stage for deeper discussions in response to Hong Kong's scenario.

- (1) **Mr. Timothy CALNIN**
Director of Tai Kwun – Centre for Heritage and Arts (The Jockey Club CPS Limited)
[Hong Kong]
- 1.1 Regarding the concept of excellence, how to measure the success artistically and creatively in a meaningful way is always challenging. Taking Australia Council for the Arts as a reference, their decision 15 years ago was that the arts companies had to work out by themselves on how they would define their success and how they would measure their quality. At the heart of it was trying to come up with something that would allow organisations to evolve and develop.
- 1.2 In assessing the success, certain level of humility is quite instructive as it would include the weakness and what has not been done well. Taking Mr. Calnin's personal example when he was the Director of Artistic Planning at the Sydney Symphony, they devised their own way of measuring success by consulting an internal artistic committee, an external panel, guest artists and conductors, etc. It is extremely worthwhile and constructive for performing arts ensemble while the quality assessment is quite organic.
- (2) **Mr. Doryun CHONG**
Deputy Director and Chief Curator of M+,
West Kowloon Cultural District Authority [Hong Kong]
- 2.1 Cross-disciplinary, inter-disciplinary and multi-disciplinary are terms that all institutions are grappling, whether or not if they are labelling themselves as the so-called "museum of official culture". But even for a contemporary art museum, it has expanded and diversify in such great ways that there are no serious museums in the world that are interested only in paintings and sculptures.
- 2.2 A key job of M+ now is setting up the new infrastructure, as well as breaking down the boundaries. Application of digital technologies is another great concern. Nowadays audience is not just coming to physical venues, but also in digital space or cyber space, for which some institutions have been working in the last few years to reach out. However, behavior, attitude and developing culture in the social media space is something that needs further exploration.
- (3) **Ms. Connie LAM**
Executive Director, Hong Kong Arts Centre
- 3.1 Cross-festivals collaboration is really important. To be a cultural city, more arts promotion is needed. Hong Kong has a lot of festivals and mega-events, as well as interesting arts activities.

By coordination and promotion, audience can be developed as they need a variety of programmes.

- 3.2 Upscaling the audience is also important by not only entertaining them but also engaging them so that they would have more nutrition. Not only critical mass audience but also connoisseur audience is needed as improvement can be made by their criticism. Audience conversion may empower Hong Kong to have more resources for better international programmes.
- 3.4 In the 21st century, technology is important for arts infrastructure. Technologies such as AI and VR are not only for the future but also for the past. For example, many young arts organisations have been borne since 1995 in Hong Kong and lots of archives and videos can go through the digitalisation.

**(4) Mr. TANG Shu-wing
Artistic Director, Tang Shu-wing Theatre Studio [Hong Kong]**

- 4.1 Policy makers, arts administrators and funders use language to define or redefine arts, and from their point of view, arts and culture must be positive and create some values. However, arts are about creating a unique artistic recuperate to express the feeling. Creation should not have a frame, but operational side of a creative work often involve values and the entire purpose of creativity will then be shifted largely to economic means, rewards and social status.
- 4.2 The overall publicity in society is that any individual succeeds if he can master technology to his service, and here lies the notion of fear. Fear of being left behind in national and international competition. If you stop that means you are going backward, but in many cases it is not true. You stop, and you see things more clearly. In some occasions, if things have laid here for thousands of years, just let them stay as they are. Do not introduce technology to alter anything. This will create a breaking of stratum in a human foundation.
- 4.3 We should not place too much emphasis on the facts that arts equals life and thinks that every citizen could be an artist, as artists are quite unique in characters, emotions and feelings. Young artists should firmly learn the skills in one discipline before talking about cross-discipline.

(5) Highlights of Q & A session of the Closing Discussion

- 5.1 Mr. Timothy CALNIN pointed out that there is a danger of being increasingly distant from the artists themselves in larger institution rather than constantly going back and listening to them. It is good to have a definition of sustainability and also an insistence on mindful presence, like demanding all participants to be number one, or sharing experience directly to several hundred people in a room.
- 5.2 In response to the question regarding failure asked by Mr. Andy Stratford, Managing Director of FutureEverything [UK], Mr. TANG Shu-wing stated the importance of failure as very often it is another success. Failure trains our minds and techniques so that we become better, but it is also painful and difficult. Hong Kong should not only invite great international masters but also trains up its own. Besides, funding body can consider making the category of funding weakness rather than funding strength.

- 5.3 Ms. Connie LAM further added that the KPI should be about the learning process and how to get improvement. Failure should be embraced as the most important thing is sustainability. She believed that funders should have their own agenda and focus.
- 5.4 Mr. Doryun CHONG believed that a whole range of opinion makes every works vibrant and ignited discourse, becoming the engine or motor. He shared two experiences to raise the idea that museum is to be a safe place for unsafe ideas and a 10% success rate is very successful already for the contemporary arts industry.
- 5.5 Ms. Tisa HO, Executive Director of Hong Kong Arts Festival, expressed that it is important for the process to have room for experimentation to embrace new things or to break the boundaries. However, keeping balance is necessary.
- 5.6 Dr. Richard GRANT, Former Chair of Creative New Zealand, highlighted that there are various ways of looking at failure, but if financial remuneration and sustainability has been taken into a structural sense as a measure of failure, it's like setting oneself for a very difficult choice about sustaining artistic creativity. Arts is not about success or failure, but about the creativity.
- 5.7 Mr. Simon BRAULT, Director & CEO of Canada Council for the Arts, gave his personal example in choosing 200 proposals out of 2,000 and although each project is highly funded, a half of million dollars each, but some came out as boring. Although artistic success is not easy to measure, they would like to take the risk. Hence, to him, failure means so perfect in proposal but a little boring in the show.
- 5.8 Mrs. Rosa Huey DANIEL, Deputy Secretary (Culture) of the Ministry of Culture, Community and Youth & Chief Executive Officer of National Arts Council [Singapore], stated that market failure should be avoided by having a thorough understanding of the markets and changes in the operating environment. As a funder, limited resources must be put at the right places.
- 5.9 Ms. Lynn YAU, Chief Executive Officer of the Absolutely Fabulous Theatre Connection [Hong Kong], believed that there is a danger by pinning too much on success and on being totally sustainable. She invited funders to have serious dialogues with artists and what truly matter to her is how the human values can be involved in funding issues.
- 5.10 Dr. Sorcha CAREY, Chair of Festivals Edinburgh [UK], emphasised that even in failure there are benchmarks for success. The arts become a drive for economic development and tourism to a sense of needing to engage with audiences and communities, but the language of arts is important by truly understanding the authentic language of the original with an effective expressing way to a wider audience and communities. Emphasis should be placed on finding our true authentic language and ways of its translation to retain our authenticity.
- 5.11 Regarding the question of Mr. Rupert MYER (Chair, Australia Council for the Arts), what funding agencies cannot afford not to focus on, Ms. Cath CARDIFF, Senior Manager, Arts Development Services, Creative New Zealand, stated that we have to be courageous about not investing in something. She believed that if you tell people what you are focusing on, if you say that it is what you want to do, most of them will get onboard with it somehow. It is only if you don't tell them, and you pretend that you are trying to do everything for everybody, that people get crossed.

- 5.12 Further to Mr. Myer’s question, Mr. Timothy CALNIN said there is a great need for Hong Kong arts scene to have an in-depth research and analysis, in order to be able to really inform where best to place the financial, resources and emphasis to achieve something. It brings up issues, trends, developments and also highlights areas of weakness. That enables the art funding bodies to consider where to be placing the emphasis, what sectors need support.
- 5.13 Moderator Dr. Wilfred Wong (Chairman of Hong Kong Arts Development Council) thanked the stimulating discussions from all the speakers. He emphasised that the HKADC, as the conglomerate of arts practitioners and administrators, should have courage to encourage both strength and weakness. Dr. Wong concluded the conference with Confucius’ idea of the importance of being balanced.

– END OF CONFERENCE –